

SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL

REPORT TO:	Development and Conservation Control Committee	1 st February 2006
AUTHOR/S:	Director of Development Services	

S/2358/05/F – Bourn
**Erection of Bungalow and Garage following Demolition of Dwelling at Easting Down,
Fox Road for P. Smith**

Recommendation: Approval
Date for Determination: 3rd February 2006

Departure Application

Site and Proposal

1. The application relates to a 0.23 hectare (0.57 acres) approximately site which is currently occupied by a 90 square metre approximately, 4.5m high approximately render and asbestos tile detached bungalow with a part flat roof/part sloping felt roof addition to the side. There is a row of trees adjacent the site's frontage with Fox Road. Currently there is no direct vehicular access to the site.
2. The site is situated amongst a small linear cluster of buildings near the intersection of Fox Road (B1046) with Ermine Street (A1198), outside of the village framework of Bourn. Adjacent the site are modest bungalows to the east, a metal-clad industrial building with a detached outbuildings to the west and fields to the north and south (on the opposite side of Fox Road). The site contains several trees, with a row of conifers situated on the adjacent site, along the property boundary with the existing workshop. The application plan indicates that conifers on the adjacent site, are to be removed.
3. The full application received on 9th December 2005, proposes the erection of a bungalow with front, rear and side gables, measuring 2.5 to the eaves and 5.9m to the ridge above ground level, and 5.65m above floor level. The dwelling would have a footprint of approximately 220 square metres and an internal floor area of 189 square metres. The proposed bungalow is setback 23m from the road frontage. A detached double garage measuring 6.0m x 6.5m x 4.6m high with hipped roof is also proposed. This garage will be setback 11m from the front property boundary.
4. Proposed materials are facing bricks and plain clay pantiles, details of which are to be agreed. A new access direct onto Fox Road is also proposed. The existing dwelling is to be demolished.

Planning History

5. Planning application **S/0311/02/F** for the erection of a replacement dwelling was withdrawn prior to determination.
6. Planning application **S/0315/03/F** for a replacement dwelling and garage/workshop/store was refused on 12th May 2003 on the grounds of being "seriously detrimental to the visual amenities of the countryside...".

7. Planning application **S/1581/03/F** for a replacement dwelling was approved on 11th September 2003. The replacement dwelling was of chalet-style with an eaves and ridge height of 2.5m and 7.2m respectively. The replacement dwelling had a footprint of approximately 132m², and an external floorarea of 196m² spread over two levels of accommodation. The approved application was subsequently amended to reduce the size of the plot and exclude existing outbuildings. This planning application has not been implemented to date.
8. Planning application **S/1928/05/F** for the erection of a bungalow and garage following demolition of the existing dwelling was received on 10th October 2005 and withdrawn on 18th November 2005. The current application differs from this earlier application in relation to the setback of the bungalow and garage from the road frontage and a reduction in the height of the double garage.

Planning Policy

9. Policy **P1/2** of the Cambridgeshire and Peterborough Structure Plan 2003 ("The County Structure Plan") states that development will be restricted in the countryside unless the proposals can be demonstrated to be essential in a particular rural location.
10. Policy **P1/3** of the County Structure Plan requires a high standard of design and sustainability for all new development and which provides a sense of place which responds to the local character of the built environment.
11. Policy **5/5** of the Country Structure Plan states that small scale housing developments will be permitted in villages only where appropriate, taking into account the need for affordable rural housing, the character of the village and its setting, and the level of jobs, services, infrastructure and passenger transport provision in the immediate area.
12. Policy **SE8** of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan ("The Local Plan") states that residential development outside village frameworks will not be permitted.
13. Policy **HG15** of the Local Plan outlines that proposals for the replacement of dwellings in the countryside will be permitted where:

“(1) the proposed replacement dwelling is in scale and character with the dwelling it is intended to replace; and
 (2) the proposed replacement dwelling would not materially increase the impact of the site on the surrounding countryside”.
14. Policy **EN5** of the Local Plan requires trees, hedges and woodland and other natural features to be retained wherever possible in proposals for new development.

Draft Local Development Framework

15. Development Control Policy **HG/7** (2006) largely repeats the contents of Policy **HG15** in the current plan. However it explicitly states in the policy itself (as opposed to the supporting text) that “The District Council will permit one-for-one replacement of dwellings in the countryside subject to the requirements of the General Permitted Development Order (i.e. a maximum enlargement of **15%** of volume) and the need to provide satisfactory internal layout of amenities...”

Consultation

16. **Bourn Parish Council** – No response received at time of writing agenda report. Response to be verbally reported. It is noted that the Parish Council recommended the approval of the previous planning application.
17. **Environment Agency** – No response received at time of writing agenda report. Response to be verbally reported. It is noted that the Environment Agency raised no objection to the previous planning application, but did recommend comments by way of informatives.
18. **Trees and Landscape Officer** – No response received at time of writing agenda report. Response to be verbally reported. It is noted that this officer recommended the approval of the previous planning application, subject to conditions of consent.
19. **Chief Environmental Health Officer** – No objection, but recommends the use of informatives in the event that the application is approved.

Representations

20. None received

Planning Comments – Key Issues

21. The key issue for consideration is whether the proposed bungalow and garage would result in harm to the visual amenities of the surrounding countryside, taking into account the previous planning permission on the site. Other important considerations are whether the proposal would adversely affect the residential amenities of the adjacent dwelling or harm the visual amenities of the streetscene.

Visual Impact on Countryside and Streetscene

22. As referred to above, planning permission was given on 11 September 2003 for the erection of a replacement dwelling in this countryside location, which was significantly larger than the existing bungalow. As such, the principle of a larger dwelling on this site than that which accords with current planning policies, has been previously established. This proposal resulted in an approximately 117% increase in the external floorarea of the existing bungalow (from 90 to 196sqm²), 91% increase in volume (323 to 624 cm³) and 2.7m increase in height (from 4.5m to 7.2m).
23. Whilst the current proposal further increases the external floorspace of the replacement dwelling to approximately 144% (from 90 to 220sqm²) and volume to approximately 183% (from 325 to 922 cm³) over the original dwelling, the proposal involves a significant reduction in the height of the dwelling (from 7.2m to 5.9m) and is more compatible in design and appearance with adjacent bungalows than the previous approval. On balance, the proposed replacement dwelling is considered to create no additional harm on the visual amenities of the countryside.
24. The implementation of the current application would inhibit the implementation of the previous planning consent, as the footprint of both dwellings partially overlap.
25. The proposed front garage is setback 11m from the front property boundary and will be partially screened by existing trees along the road frontage. This garage is considered to be of acceptable design and appearance for this rural location, and will not harm the visual amenities of the adjacent countryside or streetscene.

Impact on Amenities of Adjacent Landowners

26. I am of the view that the proposal will not seriously harm the amenities of occupants of the adjacent dwelling or commercial premise.
27. Having regard to the planning history on the site and the reduction in height of the proposed bungalow compared with the approved and extant scheme, it is considered that the application need not be referred to the Secretary of State.

Recommendation

28. Approve

Recommended Conditions of Consent

1. SCA – 3 years.
2. Sc5a – Details of materials for external walls and roofs (Rc5aii).
3. Details of boundary treatment. (Reason: to ensure that boundary features are appropriate to the rural setting of the site.).
4. SC21 – Withdrawal of Permitted Development Rights – a) Part 1 (Development within the curtilage of a Dwellinghouse – Parts A, B, C and D).
(Reason: The dwelling hereby permitted is in the countryside and in accordance with policy HG15 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2004, the Local Planning Authority would wish to ensure that any future external additions are in scale and character with the existing dwelling.)
5. The existing bungalow shall be demolished no later than within three months of the dwelling hereby approved, being occupied.
(Reason: to maintain one dwelling on the site in accordance with countryside Policy P1/2 of the Cambridgeshire and Peterborough Structure Plan 2003.)
6. Sc51 – Landscaping (Rc51).
7. Sc52 – Implementation of landscaping (Rc52).
8. SC56 – protection of frontage trees during construction. (Rc56).

Informatives

1. Reasons for Approval

Although the proposed bungalow is not in scale and character with the dwelling it is intended to replace contrary to Policy HG15 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2004, it is considered that there are material considerations which warrant the granting of consent. These material considerations include the previous planning permission for a chalet style dwelling on the site providing two levels of accommodation, the reduction in the height of proposed bungalow compared to the dwelling previously approved and improved compatibility in design and appearance of the proposed bungalow to existing bungalows within the vicinity, compared to the dwelling previously approved.

2. Environment Agency Informatives

Regarding the use of soakaways and details of surface water drainage.

3. Environmental Health Informatives

- (a) During demolition and construction there shall be no bonfires or burning of waste on site except with the prior permission of the Environmental Health Officer in accordance with best practice and existing waste management legislation.
- (b) Before the existing property is demolished, a Demolition Notice will be required from the Environmental Health Department establishing the way in which the property will be dismantled, including any asbestos present, the removal of waste, minimisation of dust, capping of drains and establishing hours of working operation.

Background Papers: the following background papers were used in the preparation of this report:

- South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2004
- Cambridgeshire and Peterborough Structure Plan 2003
- Local Development Framework, Development Control Policies, Development Plan Document, Submission Draft 2006
- Planning File Refs: S/2538/05/F, S/1928/05/F, S/1581/03/F, S/0315/03/F and S/0311/02/F

Contact Officer: Allison Tindale – Planning Assistant
Telephone: (01954) 713159